

Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

Without you: An analysis of the transposition into Portuguese of Del James' short story /

'Without you': uma análise da transposição para o português do conto de Del James

Rafael Francisco Pellin Grando *

Teacher of Portuguese and English for Elementary Education Series Initials and Finals in the private school system, Master of Arts from the Federal Technological University of Paraná, Campus Pato Branco. Researcher in the areas of Textual Linguistics and Translation Studies.



https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4830-0566

Mirian Ruffini *

Higher Education Professor with the Federal Technological University of Paraná State (Universidade Tecnológica Federal do Paraná) Campus of Pato Branco, Department and Coordination of Modern Languages, Linguistics and Literature, DALET/COLET. Researcher Professor with the Post-Graduation Program of Linguistics and Literature at UTFPR - Campus Pato Branco (PPGL). Doctor on Translation Studies, Master of Arts in Modern Languages and Specialist in English Language and Literature. Graduated in Modern Languages, Portuguese and English, and Literature. Working in the area of Modern Languages and Literature, mainly in the following fields: Literary Translation, Translation Studies, English Language and Literature, Comparative Literature.



https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3222-2519

Received: October, 22th, 2020. Approved: December, 10th, 2020.

How to cite this article:

GRANDO, Rafael Francisco Pellin; RUFFINI, Mirian. Without you: An analysis of the transposition into Portuguese of Del James' short story. *Revista Letras Raras*. Campina Grande, v. 9, n. 4, p. 164-179, dez. 2020.

rafaelfrancisco@outlook.com.br

m.ruffini95@gmail.com



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

ABSTRACT:

This paper discusses the transposition of the short story Without You by the American author Del James, a writer on the periphery of the literary sphere, his greatest works being tales of terror and his book, The language of fear. The transposition had English as its source language and its target language was Portuguese, especially Brazilian Portuguese. The analyzed work came from a translation carried out by a group of fans of the American band Guns N 'Roses called GNR Devotion Fan Club, and for that they did not have a sponsor or carried out their translation for profit. The analyzes were performed based on the theories of translation studies' authors such as Itamar Even-Zohar (2013), Andre Lefevere (2007) and Susan Bassnet (2003). This article aimed to verify whether the translation preserves Del James' style characteristics, whether it can be considered an adequate translation and what other characteristics can be perceived in that adaptation.

KEYWORDS: translation studies: transposition; Guns N 'Roses; Del James;

RESUMO:

Este artigo discorre sobre a transposição do conto Without You do autor norte-americano Del James, um autor à margem na esfera literária, sendo seus maiores trabalhos contos de terror e seu livro, A linguagem do medo. A transposição teve como língua de partida o Inglês e a língua alvo a língua portuguesa, em especial, o português brasileiro. A obra analisada foi proveniente de uma tradução realizada por um grupo de fãs da banda norte-americana Guns N' Roses chamado GNR Devotion Fan Club e para tal, não tiveram um mecenas e nem realizaram a tradução com fins lucrativos. As análises foram realizadas a partir das teorias de autores dos estudos da tradução, como Itamar Even-Zohar (2013), Andre Lefevere (2007) e Susan Bassnet (2003). Este artigo teve como objetivo verificar se a tradução preserva as características de estilo de Del James, se ela pode ser considerada uma tradução adequada e quais outras características é possível perceber nessa adaptação.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: estudos da tradução; transposição; Guns N' Roses; Del James;

1 Introduction

In 1992, at the top of their career, the American band Guns N' Roses released one of the most iconic music video clips in Hard Rock history, entitled November Rain. The clip shows a couple's tragic love story, displaying moments from their wedding, their wedding party and, shortly afterwards, the bride's funeral, who unexpectedly dies without any explanation.

The music video clip was inspired by one of the short stories written by the American author and journalist Del James, entitled *Without You*, which was published in his first book, *The Language of Fear*, in 1995, but which had been written before, in 1987. In Brazil, Del James's book has not been published yet, and his only translated short story, *Without You*, appears on some websites that share information about rock bands all over the internet. Its most popular translation is available on the Scridb website, and it was done in 2004, by a group of fans of American band Guns N' Roses, called GNR Devotion Fan Club, inspired by the connection between the music video clip and Del James' short story.

Based on and motivated by these issues, this article proposes to analyze the transposition of the original short story written by Del James, into its Brazilian Portuguese translation, which was carried out by the GNR Devotion Fan Club group, in 2004. This analysis presents relevant aspects



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

about the author, such as his style, his works, and it makes a comparison between the translation mentioned and its source text. For this purpose, theoretical-critical texts of Translation Studies' authors are referred to, such as Even-Zohar (2013), who addresses The Cultural Polysystems Theory, Susan Bassnett (2003), with her contributions regarding equivalence and the defense of organic translations and André Lefevere (2007), with his emphasis on *patronage* in the field of literary translation.

Concerning the organization of this paper, we first discuss about the author's context and the short story origin; after that, authors from the field of translation studies are presented in order to support the analyses carried out, along with their theories. The following section includes the analysis of Del James' short story translation done by the GNR Devotion Fan Club group, which we accomplished by comparing excerpts from the original work with their translation into the target language. The data discussions generated from our analysis intend to verify whether the adaptation preserves Del James' writing style, and other aspects, concerning the maintenance of meaning effects, as well as lexical and syntactic choices present in the short story.

2 Del James, the author, and the context of the short story Without You

Adalberto James Miranda, known by the stage name Del James, was born in 1964 in New York, United States. In addition to being a writer, Del James is also a journalist, becoming senior editor for HEAVY METAL magazine RIP. The author also worked as a musician, writing lyrics or co-authoring some groups of the *Rock* scene.

According to the axlrosefaclube.com, Del James is known to be a close friend of Axl Rose's, leader and main singer of American hard rock band *Guns N' Roses*. James found his inspiration from the rock star's troubled relationship with former model Erin Everly, in order to write his most famous short story, *Without You*, in 1987. However, it was only published in 1995 in his book entitled *The Language of Fear*, which features 14 other short stories.

About Del James' style, as Axl Rose reports in his introduction to *The Language of Fear* (1995, p.8), James' stories suggest doses of extreme violence, perversities, insecurity, addictions, and infidelity, as well as "a sense of destruction that may dominate anyone who can't master things". Rose also reports that Del James often called him after writing a text, always saying that he (James) would go to hell, reading the text to the singer or sending it to him by fax soon afterwards. Another definition provided by Rose (1995, p.8), about Del James' works, is that he "paints a living picture of people" because of all the elements James approaches in his writings.



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

We do not believe in the veneration of a source text, when it is contrasted with its translation or adaptation, and we try to implement analyses that are focused on the target text, as Gideon Toury recommends it, in his theoretical book *Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond* (2012). However, we believe that it is relevant to deal with the themes developed by James, in addition to exploiting the motivations for his writing process, in order to evaluate the translation in a further section.

Since Del James' story was inspired by his friend Axl Rose's relationship, it is crucial to understand the historical context in which it was written. In late 1980s and early 1990s, according to related websites specializing in songs of this genre, such as tenhomaisdiscosqueamigos.com and wishplash.net, the music scene was living through a great time for rock lovers. The band *Queen*, led by iconic vocalist Freddie Mercury, ended the tour of A Kind of Magic. In addition, Guns N' Roses launched what would become the best-selling debut album of all times, *Appetite for Destruction*, and the album ... *And Justice for All*, by Metallica reached #6 on the Billboard Chart.

According to the Polysystems Theory, coined by Even-Zohar (2013), the subsystems of culture, society and literature, among others, in a given context, interact, influence and are influenced by exchanges among people. These phenomena occur within a system or between systems, for example, in the social sphere, in the literary world, etc. For the researcher of literature and literary translation, these data can be valuable in understanding the migration of a literary work to another foreign system, in learning about the constitution of a fictional text based on occurrences of real life and the social context of a given author, etc. Thus, the exploration of James' environment, his time, his friends and his motivations are crucial to us for our understanding of his original text, which later comes to be adapted to the Brazilian language and culture, as it is in the case of *Without You*.

With several examples of destructive relationships in the successful musical world and with his best friend going through similar situations, Del James, by means of his direct and gloomy style, portrays, in *Without You* (1995), the relationship between Mayne, a rock star dominated by vices and perversions, and Elizabeth, an innocent young woman. The couple's relationship and their happy moments are also emphasized, but throughout the story, loss and guilt prevail in the narrative. We speculate the possible transfer of these semantic fields into the translation of the story, because negative feelings and love conflicts seem to constitute it.

Particularly regarding the short story *Without You*, its plot revolves around the character Mayne, a famous musician from a rock band who achieved success but ended up losing the love



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

of his life because of a moment of infidelity. The pain of separation caused Mayne to write what would become the biggest hit of his career, the song *Without You*. The song, through the character's eyes, would represent his side of the story and not a mere excuse. Mayne offered half of the rights to *Without You* to Elizabeth, but she declined his proposal.

When the tour that announced the success of Mayne's song arrived in Los Angeles, the musician decided to look for Elizabeth, as he was visiting the city where she lived. Mayne followed her to her apartment and sent her a message before going upstairs, saying he would visit her anyway because he still cared for her. As he was getting out of the elevator on the floor of Elizabeth's apartment, Mayne hears a song in the background. As he approached, it sounded louder and louder, and then his world collapsed upon hearing the dry noise of a gunshot. Mayne rushed to her apartment and found Elizabeth covered with blood, lying on her couch, with drafts of a letter by her side.

After a while, in an episode of deep depression, added to the effect of drugs and alcohol, in his apartment, Mayne was gazing at Elizabeth's photo album and, at that moment, the character began to destroy all the furniture of his house as a result of his suffering. Del James perfectly portrays his artistic gift in this scene and, added to the words said by his friend, Axl Rose, in his introduction, he (James) depicts a piece of the character's disturbed soul, after his seeing, on the last page of Elizabeth's photo album, his beloved one's death certificate. Mayne indulges himself to the superficial pleasures that freed him from the temporary pain of Elizabeth's loss, and he ends up setting fire to his apartment as he played the notes of his greatest piano music success.

At the end of this section about the source text constitution by author Del James, its production context and the possible inter-systematic motivations and influences in its conception, we describe below the translation theories that support our analyses and discussions regarding the short story's adaptation.

3 Translation Studies

Since the purpose of this article is to analyze the transposition of the short story *Without You* from American English to Brazilian Portuguese, it is pertinent to base it on Translation Studies theorists' texts. These consist of an area that includes not only studying elements of translations, but also systematizing and theorizing the translator's process in relation to the literary work in the context of departure and arrival (source and target contexts), by means of these cultural, linguistic and semantic transfers analyses.



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

For the transposition of Del James's short story, it is appropriate to use the Theory of Polysystems, since the source and target texts work with two different systems. The story originates in the American system, which has English as its mother tongue, and it reaches the Brazilian system, whose target language is Brazilian Portuguese. According to Even-Zohar (2013), it (The Polysystem) is more than a terminological convention, because its purpose is to explain a concept of system as something dynamic and heterogeneous, as it comprises several different systems and these relate to each other. In Del's short story, its migration between cultural, linguistic and literary systems and, therefore, the movement between a source of literary, musical and later translational inspiration, indicates the relevance of our analyses.

In particular, systems may be configured as dynamic networks, having hierarchy in strata formed by the intra and intersystemic relationships of their elements. Although the systems occupy competing spaces, they function as a structured whole with interdependent members, and, in turn, their competition generates a continuous tension between the polysystem center and its periphery. (CARDOSO, 2015).

Similar to Even-Zohar's argument about the polysystems theory, the theoretician of the manipulation school, or the translation cultural studies, Susan Bassnett (2003), comments that the translation process is not simply linguistic when it comes to transferring the meaning contained in a set of signs by means of dictionary and grammar competent use. Bassnett (2004) also says that the translation process involves a vast set of extra-linguistic criteria, and, at this point, Even-Zohar's theory (2013) meets this author's words, because both tenets corroborate that each language belongs to a different system and that each one has its own particularities. Consequently, adapting a text literally may not express its real meaning.

José Lambert, another theoretician who defends the translation process as being more than just a linguistic adaptation, notes the following:

Compatibilities or incompatibilities are never absolute; they are historical, and, therefore relative, even at linguistic level. The question of translations feasibility becomes, in this way, a historical and relative issue, which translators solve with their own means and conceptions, or with means and conceptions accepted by their contexts. (LAMBERT, 2001, p. 197, translated by the authors).

In other words, the translation or adaptation of a literary text from its source language to another language should not be specifically based on the grammatical issues of the target language, by relating the words used to those equivalent to the language of origin. It is necessary,



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

therefore, to analyze the historical questions of the language in addition to other particularities, such as the use of idioms, which, when translated literally, lose their original meanings.

After having learned concepts about the systems that are present in the translation process, we then move on to another very pertinent point to be explored about translation studies, that is the influence of *patronage* in the transposition of literary work. *Patronage* may be regarded as a group of agents that foster art and culture. In the same way that there are several systems in the transposition of works, as seen in the theories of Even-Zohar (2013), in *patronage* there is also a complex system of systems, which is composed by several subsystems that interact with each other.

Andre Lefevere (2007) discusses *patronage*, by both highlighting some of its characteristics and relating it to literature. The author argues that literature is one of the systems that is present in the complex "system of systems", known as culture. Culture and society are directly related to the literary system environment. These ideas reinforce the notion that systems are connected to each other and they also support the argument that literature is a great form of groups', ethnicities' and peoples' cultural manifestation.

Patronage has an interest in the ideology of literature, besides its poetics and status, and it may be performed by people or groups. Because of this, patronage regulates several factors that imply the distribution of literary works and their translations. Lefevere (2007) comments that there are several agents or actors for this regulation and control in the literary system, which are employed by patrons, such as professionals, critics, teachers and translators, for example, who can accept or reject consonant or divergent works concerning the concept of a dominant poetics.

For *patronage*, still according to Lefevere (2007), three elements are crucial for the operation of the system. The first one is based on the ideology or content of the literary work. A literary production being aligned with the thought of a patron or group is perhaps the main factor for obtaining endorsement and its consequent financing. The second element is the economic aspect, since it guarantees writers and rewriters a way of living, and perhaps the achievement of profit. Finally, the third element lies in lifestyle. *Patronage* is predominantly concerned with ideology in relation to literature, since the status that these literary works acquire is more pertinent to the market aspect than just its underlying beauty and art.

Just as many works are located on the margins of literature, *patronage* is not a uniform system, and it can be divided into undifferentiated and differentiated types. Lefereve (2007) points out that undifferentiated *patronage* is one that has the three elements (ideology, economy and



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

status) provided by one agent, while the differentiated model occurs when economic success is relatively independent of ideological factors and it does not grant any status, which makes the translator, or the translation process, more independent.

After concluding the theoretical discussion, the following section analyzes the transposition of Del James' short story into Brazilian Portuguese.

4 Analysis

Based on the scholars from translation studies, the first point of analysis in this article, about the transposition of Del James' short story *Without You* to Brazilian Portuguese, is the configuration of the story's translation forms. As mentioned earlier, patronage plays a very dominant role in literature, because, due to several factors, it regulates how a literary product may be adapted to another language or it may even decide that it should be discarded, if it does not follow the same ideological principles with which the patron identifies himself.

A crucial point to support this analysis is that the story of origin, *Without You*, comes from an author situated on the margins of American literature, with little prominence and relevance. The genre that James addresses, horror, has known iconic names in literature, such as Stephen King, currently, Edgar Alan Poe, as a classical writer and, more recently, Lovecraft who, despite being a writer from late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, becomes popular many years after his death. Hence, by applying the notion of periphery and center, with regard to literary texts, which is explained by theorists Even-Zohar (2013), Gideon Toury (2012), among others, it is perceived that James' work occupies a peripheral position in literature, while the other authors mentioned would be part of the literary canon of the terror genre. The following discussions offer some possible reasons for this assessment of James' literature.

Although there is a reading public for the style and genre that James uses in his works, the author has never had much prominence in the literary field, which can be justified by some facts. Del James has not published many books throughout his career, being *The Language of Fear* his only known volume, until the moment. There is another compilation of stories about the same theme, entitled *Halloween Carnival pt 2* and edited by Brian James Freeman, in which James collaborates with other writers. Another reason to justify James' limited fame is perhaps the combination of his literary life with his musical career, which led the author to have several focuses during his life and contributed to the restricted dissemination of his name in the literary sphere.



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

Having exposed these facts about Del James, we explain that the translation of his short story, *Without You*, from English to Portuguese, happened through a group of Brazilian fans of the band Guns N' Roses. The fans, who knew about the relationship between one of the group's greatest hits - the song November Rain -, and the short story written by James, decided to adapt the original text to Brazilian Portuguese. This adaptation was not directly influenced by a patron and, therefore, it occurred under an undifferentiated kind of *patronage*, because the translation of the short story never aimed at economic purposes, but rather, its dissemination, probably towards the band's most loyal fans. These consume not only songs and music videos, but also the influences and the musical group's entire universe, such as the style of clothes that their idols wear and even the ideologies that they follow.

When it comes to language, Del James' writing uses various metaphors to portray the conflict of his characters. An example of this can be seen in the following excerpt of the source text, compared to the target text, in the table below:

Table 1: comparison between the short story and its translation

SOURCE-TEXT	TARGET TEXT (TRANSLATION)
Her eyes sparkled, reminding him of the ocean, vast with beauty and mystery. A slight breeze danced through her lion's mane. A full-length see-through dress covered her shapely body and a light glaze of sweat made her glisten. (JAMES, 1995, p. 124).	Os olhos dela faiscavam, lembrando-lhe um oceano, vasto, com toda a sua beleza e miséria. Uma fraca neblina dançava através de seu corpo. Um olhar comprido fazia ele ver através do vestido que cobria a figura do corpo dela e uma luz envidraçada de suor a fazia brilhar. (GNR DEVOTION FAN CLUB, 2004, p. 03)

Source: Table elaborated by the authors

The first sentence of the adaptation respects, to a great extent, the original author's word choices, and his punctuation options. However, the translators' choice for the word "mystery" was not "mistério", but "miséria". This choice directly reflects on the character's construction, since describing Elizabeth as "mysterious" probably would not have the same impact as the term "miserable", in the sense of sad or unhappy. Taking the story as an organic whole and James' construction of his character, the translation team possibly considered that the character fit better as unfortunate than mysterious, and therefore, the choice seems to respect what is portrayed by James, and it allows Portuguese-speaking readers to capture the essence of Elizabeth's character.



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

Susan Bassnett (2003) advocates an approach in which an organic translation is prioritized. The researcher deals with poetic translation in these terms, by arguing that form, semantic aspects, rhymes and other elements of poetry ought to be taken into account together, and not separately. By applying the theoretician's postulate to the translation of short fiction genre, we perceive its pertinence, since, ideally, all elements of the narrative must be targeted at in translation, such as plot, the constitution of characters, type of narration, among others. As regards the translation of *Without You*, the group apparently elaborates the adjectives for Elizabeth's character based on the tragic and melancholic tone of the story, and not just on the excerpts of her appearance, within the narrative.

In the second part of the excerpt, there is a more significant change, because while James describes Elizabeth physically, referring to her hair as a lion's mane, the adaptation takes away the comparative metaphor and simply replaces it by the word "body". As a whole, the excerpt does not suffer loss of meaning; however, it demonstrates that there is loss of details that contributes to the creation of the character's mental image for the reader. This alteration raises the question of equivalence when translating a literary piece of work. Rodrigues (2000) states the following about equivalence:

The notion of equivalence, as proposed in the texts in which it is central, presupposes that linguistic exchanges can be carried out with perfect balance, in an idealized relationship between peoples and cultures, in which two languages are in a symmetrical position. Thinking about the issue of multiplicity of languages and that of cultural violence means unmasking this notion of balance, because the translator's choices always point to the construction of values - which are never in perfect symmetry (RODRIGUES, 2000, p. 92, translated by the authors).

In other words, languages have their own structures, a perfect symmetry is something difficult to achieve, and when a translator changes words to maintain meaning in a translation, he is making his most appropriate translation option for that moment. Bassnett (2003) emphasizes four types of equivalence: linguistic, which is achieved word for word, pragmatic, attained by the number of elements, stylistic, which refers to the source writer's peculiarities, and textual, when there is equivalence of form. In the excerpt from the adaptation mentioned before, in table one, as an example of *Without You*, as well as in the whole story, there does not appear to be a concern about any of the equivalence types pointed out by Bassnett, but rather about the equivalence of meanings that the original story proposes to arouse. Another example attempting to prove that there is no apparent equivalence, in any of the four manners presented by Bassnett, is that in the



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

original text, the excerpt is situated in the middle of a paragraph. However, in the adaptation executed by the GNR Devotion Fan Club, that part is located at the beginning of a new paragraph; hence, there is no equivalence of form.

Oliveira (2007) states another relevant point about equivalence:

Unquestionably, the discipline of Translation Studies brought innovations to the thought of translation and equivalence. It provided for those who care about translation research fields that exceeded the rigidity desired by traditional linguistics. Moreover, by adopting positions related to the reception of the text and the interpretation of the translator as a cultural agent, it showed that equivalence could only take place in a contextualized and negotiated way, which, in some way, highlights the fact that translation is not a simple repetition of the author's words in another language. (OLIVEIRA, 2007, p. 105, translated by the authors).

From what Oliveira (2007) declares, in the translation of the short story *Without You*, the paradigmatic axis chosen by James, when writing his work, is not the same one from which the group GNR Devotion Fan Club chose to translate the story into Portuguese. Since this is not a repetition of words, as the author argues, it again shows that the group decided to preserve meaning and not the choice of words.

Moving onto another example, Del James' short story brings dialogues and these respect the American English language standard, with the use of quotation marks to inform the reader that this is not narration, but the speech of a character. This can be seen in the example of the table below, from James' work, and the same passage of the dialogue, this time, from the adaptation to Portuguese:

Table 2: Comparison between the short story and its translation

SOURCE-TEXT	TARGET-TEXT
-------------	-------------

Revista Letras Rasas

ISSN: 2317-2347 - v. 9. n. 4 (2020)

Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

Yeah?" spat an unenthusiastic voice from a car phone. "It's me," Mayne said, swallowing, cocaine dripping down his throat.

"My main man," Jamie's voice declared like a cash register ringing. "What can I do ya for?"

"Uptown and downtown." Cocaine and heroin.

"No problem. You remember what I did for ya last night, right?" "Yeah.

"He didn't. "You owe me three bills from that shit brother man," the dealer explained just in case memory failed. I'm sure I got some change floatin' around. If I can't find some I'll five ya my Versateller card and you can get what I owe."

"Bet. I'll be right up," Jamie said as if he was doing Mayne a favor and hung up.

"Fuckin' prick," Mayne mumbled to himself. (JAMES, 1995, p. 127)

"Yeah?" cuspiu uma voz, sem entusiasmo, do telefone do carro.

"Sou eu", Mayne disse, engolindo a cocaína que estava gotejando na sua garganta.

"Meu homem especial", declarou a voz de Jamie como uma caixa registradora soando. "O que eu posso fazer por você?"

"Uptown and Downtown", cocaína e heroína.

"Você se lembra do que eu fiz por ti na última vez, certo?"

"Sim". Ele não se lembrava.

"Você me deve três contos daquela merda, irmão", o fornecedor explicou a título de prevenção que a sua memória falhava.

"Estou certo de que tenho algum troco flutuando por aqui. Se eu não achar nada te darei meu cartão Versatelle e você terá o que eu te devo."

"Apostado, estarei aí em breve", Jamie disse como se estivesse fazendo um favor para Mayne e desligou. "Ferrão de merda", Mayne resmungou para ele mesmo (GNR DEVOTION FAN CLUB, 2004, p. 07)

Source: Table elaborated by the authors

Remarkably, when adapting the work to Portuguese language, the translation team of the short story *Without You* chose to maintain the indications of dialogues of the original text, by using quotation marks. Generally, the Brazilian Portuguese pattern used in narrative books has dialogue initiated by a retreat or something also known as "paragraph", and it is followed by the popular "indent". Similar to the hyphen, however, of larger size, this is followed by the character's speech, another indent and then the narrative sequence.

An example of a dialogue pattern of literary work in Portuguese, which uses indentations to indicate direct speech, can be verified as follows:

- Você demorou! Disse Lisa para sua esposa, Victoria chegava perto das nove horas do departamento de polícia.
- Desculpe por n\u00e3o ter avisado. Hoje o dia estava cheio, precisei ficar at\u00e9 mais tarde e terminar o relat\u00f3rio de um desaparecimento. Respondeu Vick tirando seus cal\u00e7ados. (Exemplo dos autores)

In addition to the peculiar decision to keep quotation marks to indicate the dialogue rather than the paragraph and indentation, as it is frequently used, there are two other details in this same excerpt of the adaptation that deserve to be cited. The first fact is that the group did not translate the expressions "Uptown" and "Downtown" which refer, respectively, in Portuguese to "parte remota da cidade" (remote part of the city) and "Centro" (center of the city), because they were, in



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

fact, nicknames for the drugs that Mayne asked his drug dealer for. The option for not to translate these words may have occurred for two reasons: there is no equivalent, as a single word, for "uptown" in Portuguese, or rather, the group may have opted to follow a more foreignizing way of translation, in the terms by Lawrence Venuti, conveyed in his book *Scandals of Translation* (2002). The foreignizing translation is more linked to the context of departure and the carrier of its cultural residues. On the other hand, the domesticating translation is more centered on the context of arrival and it reads more fluently for the translation receiver, which can explain their choice of using quotation marks for the dialogue.

The second detail is that the swear words, or licentious terms, used by James, were not censored by the GNR devotion fan club. This absence of censorship may have happened because the group is not connected to a patron, who may censor obscene words to serve a larger audience, or for any other ideological reason. Some excerpts with these words have been translated literally, and sometimes they do not present the real meaning of the context used for the expression, one of which is a swear word linked to the word "prick", as it is adapted to the term "sting" (ferrão, in Portuguese). The use of this adaptation, even within the context, does not make what the character is saying clear, because there is nothing in the target language related to the expression of the source language, that being just an expression of joy or celebration.

Despite the softened choice of translation for the expression "prick", the lack of censorship adopted by the group during the adaptation may have been intentional, or only coincidental, so as to preserve Del James' style, which includes, in his short stories, a number of very present lustful words. One justification would be that rock celebrities often verbalize such words, and this may have influenced James in his writing process of *Without You*, which, in turn, was preserved by translators of the adaptation into Portuguese.

Other two very pertinent points to be observed about the translation to Brazilian Portuguese was that the group GNR Devotion Club slightly modified one of the short story characters' name. While in the original work Del James uses "Elizabeth", the translators chose to use "Elisabeth", making the exchange of "Z" for "S". This change apparently breaks foreignizing patterns that, until then, had been adopted in the adaptation, and it domesticates the character's name to a written way closer to the target language model.

The second fact is a negative point for the adaptation, in the case of deviations from the standard norm of the Portuguese language. In more than ten occurrences, the translators stopped punctuating correctly, with a comma before "but", an adversarial conjunction. The absence of a



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

comma sometimes seems to be owing to the work of origin form, in which James, in certain sentences, does not use the comma; however, in Portuguese, one should use the punctuation (comma) before "but" (mas) in order to respect the standard norm of the language. In English, on the other hand, there are specific rules that allow both cases. For sentences to be written without the comma they must have clauses that are not independent; in contrast, when sentences have independent clauses, it is necessary to use the comma. The deviation that the GNR Devotion Club group has made can be seen in the following excerpt: "Certas guitarras traziam memórias mas cada guitarra tinha a habilidade de criar a mágica" (GNR DEVOTION CLUB, 2004, p. 12, authors' highlight).

Despite these occurrences, there are also rare cases in which the translation respected the standard norm of the Portuguese language, by inserting commas in excerpts whose original passages did not include. These insertions can be compared in the following extracts, in the table below:

Table 3: comparison between story and translation:

SOURCE-TEXT	TARGET-TEXT
[] crack, or smack to troubled celebrities, exploiting their vulnerabilities. Mayne searched for more clues as to who else had been over partying but came up blank (JAMES, 1995, p. 125).	[] crack ou heroína para celebridades problemáticas, explorando seu lado vulnerável. Mayne procurou mais vestígios de quem mais esteve fazendo festa lá, mas veio um branco (GNR DEVOTION CLUB, 2004, p. 5, grifo dos autores).

Source: table elaborated by the authors

The amount of deviations that the adaptation makes regarding the issue of comma in sentences, in comparison with the times the comma was inserted in the work of destination correctly, visibly leads us to believe two hypotheses. First, the adaptation was based mainly on the punctuation of the original work, thus ignoring the standard norms of the target language; or there was no care or even a thorough revision of writing of the Portuguese language in the adaptation.

Another case that reinforces the revision of the target language having been superficial are deviations from the standard norm of Portuguese in relation to the pronominal placement of some sentences. As an example, we find: "Mayne acordou coberto de suor, se encolheu calado ainda com a garganta seca (GNR DEVOTION CLUB, 2004, p. 4, authors' highlight)". In this passage, the pronoun "se" (himself) is situated in front of the verb "encolher" (shrink), as there is a pause by comma, there is no attraction factor of the pronoun, so the sentence should be written "encolheu-



Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

se" (shrunk). Once the analyses have been carried out, our final considerations are included in the following section.

Final considerations

Because it is a translation done independently by a group of fans, the short story *Without You* is convincingly adapted for those who want to know more about the influences of the song and the video clip November Rain, created by the American band, Guns N' Roses. Del James' style and his word choices are maintained in the transposition of *Without You* to the Portuguese language, which seems to keep James' characteristic by portraying faceted and self-destructive characters in his work. Non-censorship also contributes to offer the sense of realism of the original or source text, and it seems to be done according to the inspirations received by James during the course of his literary life.

However, not everything is positive in the adaptation of *Without You*. As it can be perceived in the cited fragments, the absence of a thorough review of the target language caused some punctuation problems and deviations from the standard norm rules of the Portuguese language. Despite the clear attempt to remain close to the original/source text, ignoring commas where James did not use them, absence does not make the intention more relevant than the respect for norms.

Another controversial issue is the choice of the American standard of dialogue with quotation marks in a literary system in which the paragraph and indentation predominate for the same function. This choice combines with the non-translation of slang and nicknames, keeping the adaptation with a foreign air, but also with aspects of domestication when modifying the letter of one of the character's name, making it written closer to the target language. This mixture of foreignizing and domesticated elements does not give us clues as to whether they were purposeful or coincidental, being the most plausible hypothesis that the translation group simply wanted to make Del James' story accessible to everyone, while not worrying excessively about technical translation details.

To conclude, as a whole, the translation or adaptation is quite equivalent to the original work, maintaining the author's stylistic characteristics and delivering a good text to the reader. The deviations committed in the target language do not take away the brilliance and catharsis that Del James' short story offers in its original form. These deviations, added to the American pattern of dialogue, may even cause discomfort for more critical readers, but in no way detract from the meaning and atmosphere that the original work conveys.

Revista Letras Rasas

ISSN: 2317-2347 - v. 9. n. 4 (2020)

Todo o conteúdo da RLR está licenciado sob Creative Commons Atribuição 4.0 Internacional

References

BASSNETT, S. *Estudos da Tradução*: Fundamentos de uma disciplina. Lisboa: Fundação Cauloste Gulberkian, 2003;

BERNARDI, R. 8 artistas que se tornaram grandes com seus álbuns de estreia. Tenho mais discos que amigos, 2018. Disponível em: < http://www.tenhomaisdiscosqueamigos.com/2018/11/19/artistas-grandes-discos-estreia/> Acesso em 28 dez 2018;

BONANI, G. Love Kills: Histórias de amor trágicas do mundo da música. Crasso, 2017. Disponível em: http://www.crasso.com.br/news/love-kills-historias-de-amor-tragicas-do-mundo-da-musica/ Acesso em 29 dez 2018;

CARDOSO, A. C. B. *La Fontaine no Brasil*: história, descrição e análise paratextual de suas traduções. UFSC, Florianópolis, 2015 – Tese de doutorado.

COSTA, R. Metallica: And Justice For All é um album injustiçado? Whisplash, 2007. Disponível em: < https://whiplash.net/materias/cds/061226-metallica.html> Acesso em: 28 dez 2018;

Del James. Axl Rose Fã Clube. Disponível em: http://axlrosefaclube.com/del-james/ Acesso em 29 dez 2018;

EVEN-ZOHAR, I. Teoria dos polissistemas. *Revista Translatio 4*. [Marozo, Luis Fernando, Carlos Rizzon & Yanna Karlla Cunha trans.], 2013, pp. 2-21;

GNR DEVOTION CLUB. Sem você. in: *A linguagem do medo*. 2004. Disponível em: https://pt.scribd.com/document/55947828/A-Linguagem-Do-Medo acesso em 28 dez 2018;

JAMES, D. The Language of Fear. Nova York, 1995.

JOSÉ, C. As mulheres de Axl Rose. Axl Rose Fã Clube, 2013. Disponível em: < http://axlrosefaclube.com/2013/04/as-mulheres-de-axl-rose/> Acesso em 28 dez 2018;

LAMBERT, J. *Literatura & tradução*: textos selecionados de José Lambert / Andréia Guerini, Marie-Hélène Catherine Torres e Walter Costa (orgs.). - Rio de Janeiro: 7 Letras, 2011;

LEFEVERE, A. Capítulo 2: O sistema: Mecenato. In: *Tradução, reescrita e manipulação da fama literária*. Bauru, SP: Edusc, 2007. p. 29-49;

OLIVEIRA, A. R. de. Equivalência: Sinônimo de Divergência. *Cadernos de Tradução*, V1, n. 19, Florianópolis, Brasil. 97-114;

RODRIGUES, C. C. Tradução: A questão da equivalência. Alfa, São Paulo, n 44. 89-98, 2000;

ROSE, W. A. Introdução. In: JAMES, D. The Language of Fear. New York, 1995, p.8-10.

TOURY, Gideon. Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond. 2 ed. John Benjamins B. V., 2012.